## **Appendix I**



Wallkill River National Wildlife Refuge headquarters in Sussex, New Jersey

# **Consultation and Coordination with Others**

- **■** Background
- Public Involvement Summary/Reaching out to the Public
- **■** Release of Draft CCP

### **Background**

We started preplanning for a single CCP/EA for both the Wallkill River and Shawangunk Grasslands national wildlife refuges in late fall of 1998. Later, in November 2002, we decided to write separate plans for each refuge. We selected the Shawangunk Grasslands refuge as our first priority.

Our planning team, which consisted of Service employees and employees of the states of New York and New Jersey, first met in February 1999 to get acquainted with the planning process and start collecting information about the natural resources and public uses on both refuges. We developed vision statements and preliminary goals for both refuges, and identified preliminary issues and management concerns.

Early in 1999, we compiled a mailing list of about 3,000 groups, elected officials, state agencies, adjacent landowners, and other individuals to ensure that we would be contacting a broad sample of the affected public as our planning progressed. In spring 1999, we mailed them an issues workbook that solicited written comments on refuge management topics. We also distributed the workbooks at refuge headquarters and offered them at every public function refuge staff attended.

Of the more than 3,000 workbooks we distributed, the public completed and returned 337. Their responses on managing wildlife habitat, providing public use, protecting land, and playing a role in neighboring communities strongly influence the way this final CCP addresses issues of concern for protecting resources and providing compatible, wildlife-dependent, recreational use. Please note that our workbook questions apply to both refuges; we cannot differentiate responses that may apply to only one.

In May and June 1999, we invited the public to seven open houses: two in Sparta, N.J.; two in Vernon, N.J.; two in Wallkill, N.Y.; and one in Warwick, N.Y. We advertised them in news releases, radio broadcasts, and notices to our mailing list. More than 50 people attended. We also organized several separate meetings to discuss specific issues with our conservation partners and state agencies (see below).

In October 1999, we released our "Fall 1999 Planning Update." It summarized the public comments we received in the planning workbook and the open houses, identified the key issues the CCP/EA would address, and shared our revised vision statements and goals for the refuge with everyone on our mailing list.

Once we finalized the key issues, we began to develop alternative strategies to address each one. The fully developed management alternatives in chapter 3 of the draft CCP/EA evolved from those strategies, public comments, and the refuge purposes and goals. We shared our proposed alternatives in follow-up meetings with our conservation partners, state agencies and the public in 2000.

We shared those revised goals and highlights of the draft alternatives for the CCP with the public in our Fall 2001 and Winter 2002 Planning Update, as well as in our September 2005 Planning Update. They provided the public with the opportunity to ask questions and make comments on the most up-to-date information.

#### **Public Involvement Summary/Reaching Out to the Public**

**Meeting Our Refuge Neighbors at Open Houses**  May 18, 1999

Number of non-FWS attendees: 4 Location: Sparta, N.J.

Location: Wallkill, N.Y. (Ulster County)

April 13, 2002

May 1, 2002

Society

June 9, 1999

May 19, 1999

Number of non-FWS attendees: 20 Location: Vernon, N.J.

June 17, 1999

Number of non-FWS attendees: 25

Number of non-FWS attendees: 36

Number of non-FWS attendees: 16

Audience: Orange County Audubon

Audience: Edgar A. Mearns Bird Club

Number of non-FWS attendees: 25

Location: Warwick, N.Y.

Location: Middletown, N.Y.

**Updating Various** Constituencies on Our **Progress** 

March 7, 2001

Number of non-FWS attendees: 25

Location: Wallkill, N.Y.

Audience: Shawangunk-Gardiner

**Historical Society** 

April 24, 2001

Number of non-FWS attendees: 25

Location: Wallkill, N.Y.

Audience: Wallkill Women's Club

July 11, 2001

Number of non-FWS attendees: 40

Location: New Paltz, N.Y.

Audience: Wallkill River Task Force

October 20, 2001

Number of non-FWS attendees: 10 Location: Shawangunk, N.Y.

Audience: Wallkill River Task Force

September 28, 2002

Location: Goshen, N.Y.

Number of non-FWS attendees: 60

Location: Monticello, N.Y.

Audience: Audubon Council of NYS

December 7, 2001

Number of non-FWS attendees: 35 Location: West Nyack, N.Y.

Audience: Rockland Audubon Society

October 16, 2002

Number of non-FWS attendees: 18 Location: Hackensack, N.J.

Audience: Bergen County Audubon

Society

**Working Meetings with Conservation Experts** 

We organized working meetings in fall 1999 and 2000 to synthesize expert opinions, both inside and outside the Service, on creating effective strategies for

preservation.

April 4, 1999

Outreach Activity: CCP Planning Meeting

Purpose:

Non-FWS attendees:

Audience:

Nancy McGarigal, Libby Herland, Leon Latino

Topics: Budget, affected environment, open house times and locations

September 1-2, 1999

Outreach Activity: CCP Planning Meeting

Update the status of the CCP for the Wallkill and Shawangunk refuges, identify Purpose:

key issues, discuss goals and objectives and begin listing general alternatives

Non-FWS attendees:

Audience:

Nancy McGarigal, Libby Herland, Carl Schwartz, Kevin Holcomb, Norman Olson, Allison Whitlock, Leon Latino, Randy Dettmers, Melissa Brewer, Jeff

Shryer, Will Waldron, Shelley Hight, Joe McCauley

To focus on the pre-planning stage of the CCP process

Topics: Archaeology, affected environment, EcoSearch, Wilderness Review, integrating

migratory bird conservation, landbird conservation plans, fisheries surveys, public use, adjacent lands management, budget and staff and community

relations

September 22, 1999

Outreach Activity: CCP Planning Meeting

Purpose: Update the status of the CCP for the Wallkill and Shawangunk refuges and

discuss goals and objectives for future development of the CCP

Non-FWS attendees: 4

Audience: Nancy McGarigal; Leon Latino; Jeff Shryer; Libby Herland; Andrew Milliken;

Kevin Holcomb; John Garcia, Div Parks Land Acquisition Trenton, NJ; Dennis Miranda, NJ Conservation Fund; Susan Curry, NJ Conservation Fund Land

Acquisition; Paul Stern, State Parks Service, Northern Region

Topics: Cultural resources issues, conflicts in public use, species of concern list,

communities of special concern

October 13-14, 1999

Outreach Activity: Planning Meeting

Purpose: Update the status of the CCP for the Wallkill and Shawangunk refuges and

discuss alternatives

Non-FWS attendees: 3

Audience: Jim Sciascia, Principal Biologist, NJDEP Fish, Game and Wildlife; Joe Penkala,

Regional Superintendent, NJDEP Fish, Game and Wildlife; Ted Kerpez,

Endangered Species Coordinator, NYSDEC

Topics: Focus areas; marsh and grassland bird nesting in Wallkill; species of concern;

land prioritization; public use; alternatives

June 20, 2000

Outreach Activity: EcoSearch Meeting

Purpose: To bring everyone up to date on the status of the EcoSearch Project for Wallkill

River refuge and to determine new timelines and responsibilities

Non-FWS attendees: 0

Audience: Tony Léger, Hank Short, Nancy McGarigal, Greg Thompson, Jay Hestbeck,

Linda Shaffer, Linda Roberts

Topics: EcoSearch deadlines; how to use EcoSearch in CCP planning

July 18-19, 2000

Outreach Activity: CCP Planning Meeting

Purpose: Update the status of the CCP for the Wallkill and Shawangunk refuges and

discuss alternatives

Non-FWS Attendees: 0

Audience: Nancy McGarigal, Jeff Shryer, Allison Whitlock, Kevin Holcomb, Sarah

Bevilacqua, Bethany Campbell, Leon Latino, Libby Herland, Tony Léger

Topics: EcoSearch and mapping, land acquisition, discussion of the Preliminary Project

Proposal, criteria within Focus areas, public use (hunting, trails and access)

August 30-31, 2000

Outreach Activity: CCP Planning Meeting

Purpose: Update the CCP process; discuss draft chapters of CCP

Non-FWS Attendees: 1

Audience: Nancy McGarigal, Leon Latino, Libby Herland, Jeff Shryer, Mike Valent, NJ

T&E coordinator (attended day 2)

Topics: Wallkill River refuge website, scheduling, chapter 1, chapter 3 and invasive,

exotic and overabundant species

October 4, 2000

Outreach Activity: CCP Planning Meeting, New Jersey Focus

Purpose: Update the CCP process; discuss the draft PPP proposal

Non-FWS attendees: 6

Audience: Mike Valent, NJDEP Non-Game Program; John Garcia, NJDEP Parks

and Forestry, Chief of Capital Planning and Programming; Lou Cherapy, NJDEP Parks and Forestry, Regional Superintendent; Paul Stern, NJDEP Superintendent, Northern Regional Office NJDEP Parks and Forestry; Terry Caruso, NJ Green Acres Program; Beverly Muzalla, NJ Natural Lands Trust/NJ

Parks and Forestry

Topics: Various land protection programs; how to achieve cooperation; local responses to

state land acquisition

December 12, 2000

Outreach Activity: CCP Planning Meeting

Purpose: Discuss PPP; chapters within CCP and assign jobs to planning team members.

Non-FWS attendees: 0

Audience: Kevin Lowry, Kevin Holcomb, Jeff Shryer, Libby Herland, Leon Latino, Nancy

McGarigal

Topics: PPP, EcoSearch, sod farm management, existing EAs, alternatives chapter

March 20, 2001

Outreach Activity: CCP Planning Meeting

Purpose: Update the CCP process; discuss the draft PPP proposal and objectives.

Non-FWS attendees:

Audience: Nancy McGarigal, Libby Herland, Kevin Holcomb, Leon Latino Topics: PPP update, EcoSearch, archaeological survey, members' schedules

May 24, 2001

Outreach Activity: CCP Planning Meeting

Purpose: To discuss the status of the CCP and proposed actions for land acquisition and

public use

Non-FWS attendees:

Audience: Bob McDowell and Dave Chanda, NJDEP; Tony Léger; Dick Dyer; Libby

Herland; Kevin Holcomb; Nancy McGarigal

Topics: State involvement in CCP's, Forked River Game Farm, resource protection

throughout NJ, Holgate situation

July 27, 2001

Outreach Activity: CCP Planning Meeting

Purpose: Discuss planning updates, revised objectives and land acquisition planning.

Non-FWS attendees:

Audience: Libby Herland, Kevin Holcomb, Allison Whitlock, Nancy McGarigal, Leon Latino Topics: Salamander and vernal pool surveys, grasslands study, land acquisition planning,

planning updates

November 27-29, 2001

Outreach Activity: CCP Planning Meeting

Purpose: To involve state biologists in our planning effort for waterfowl, game

management, fisheries, and land protection

Non-FWS Attendees: 2

Audience: Dave Chanda, NJDEP; Patricia Hamilton, NJDEP; Libby Herland; Steve Kahl;

Kevin Holcomb; Alison Whitlock; Nancy McGarigal; Bill Archambault

Topics: Fish resources and recreational fishing opportunities; land acquisition; EA

chapters 2 and 4; and discussion of next Planning Update, hunting permit

program, and new compatibility determinations

May 17, 2005

Outreach Activity: CCP Planning Meeting

Purpose: Discuss CCP issues and conduct a refuge tour for Philip Sczerzenie, focusing on

areas where management proposals from the CCP will have the most impact on

the environment

Non-FWS Attendees:

Audience: Beth Goldstein; Edward Henry; Kevin Holcomb, Brad Milley; Philip Sczerzenie,

Mangi Environmental Group

Topics: Chronic Wasting Disease (CWD), prescribed burning, compatibility

determinations, environmental consequence chapter, restoring natural hydrology

to pond behind refuge headquarters

July 20, 2005

Outreach Activity: Cooperative Land Protection Workshop

Purpose: Presentations made by each participant on current land protection and a

discussion of future land protection

Non-FWS attendees: 13

Audience: Mike Inganamort, Congressman Scott Garrett; Lisa Plevin, Senator Lautenberg;

Mada Liebman, Senator Corzine; Pat Lynch, National Parks Service; Tom Sampson; Bill Koch; Lisa Arroyo; Mike Valent, NJDEP, DFW, ENSP; Rich Osborn, NJ Green Acres; Ingrid Vandegaer, NJCF; Terrence Nolan, Trust For Public Land; Gylla Macgregor, NJ Audubon Society; Tom Wells, The Nature Conservancy; Donna Traylor, Sussex County Farmland Preservation and

Conservation; Barbara Davis, Morris Land Conservancy; Jim Doherty, Wantage; Edward Henry; Kevin Holcomb; Brad Milley; Mao Lin; Beth Goldstein; Tom

Sampson; Philip Sczerzenie

Topics: Various land protection issues as brought up by each participant included funding

land protection, priorities for land protection, and how to collaborate with each

other to protect lands

September 28-29, 2005

Outreach activity: CCP Planning Meeting

Purpose: To review chapters 1 (introduction), 2 (affected environment) and part of

chapter 3 (alternatives); discuss the LPP

Non FWS attendees: 0

Audience: Beth Goldstein, Mao Lin, Edward Henry and Kevin Holcomb

Topics: Compatibility determinations, which actions to include in Alternative A versus in

Alternative B, updates to affected environment sections, Land Protection Plan

proposed acquisition boundary

**December 1, 2005** 

Outreach activity: LPP meeting with State partners; CCP Planning Meeting

Purpose: To present the draft LPP to State partners and ask for input

Non FWS attendees: 15

Audience: Attending from the State: From the Green Acres Program: Fawn McGee, Terry

Caruso, Lisa Stern, Pam Their, Curt Gellerman, Rich Osborn, Liz Mataset, Larry Fink, Chrystal Clark, and Barb Fischer. From NJ Fish and Wildlife: Lisa Carben and Dave Chanda. From NJ Parks and Forestry: Paul S. Sedor (in for Lynn Fleming), and Steve Ellis, Regional superintendent of the north parks. From NJ Natural Lands Trust: Martin Rapp. From USFWS: Beth Goldstein,

Edward Henry, Kevin Holcomb and Brad Milley

Discussion topics: Update our state partners on the CCP planning on process and share with them

our progress on the Land Protection Plan. Obtain feedback on the proposed

expansion areas

February 2, 2006

Outreach activity: LPP meeting with Wallkill River Watershed Management Group

Purpose: Exchange information

Non-FWS attendees: 2

Audience: Ernie Hofer and Nathaniel Sajdak from the Wallkill River Watershed

Management Group

Topics: The LPP Focus Area of Papakating Creek; imminent threats of development in

the Wallkill River Valley; imminent threats of development in the Papakating Creek area; water quality issues; exchange GIS information such as Land Use/

Land cover

February 27, 2007

Outreach activity: Land Protection Partners meeting
Purpose: Update our partners on the CCP/LPP

Non-FWS attendees: 23

Audience: John Parke, NJ Audubon; Larry Herrighty, NJ Division of Fish and Wildlife;

Bob McDowell, Sussex Federation; Carolyn Fefferman, Senator Menendez's Office; Tom Gravel, Trust for Public Land; Eric Olsen, The Nature Conservancy; Ken Nelson, Wantage Open Space Committee; Mim Dunn, NJ Department of Fish and Wildlife; Nathanial Sajdak and Ernie Hofer, Wallkill River Watershed Management Group; Ted Kerpez, NY State Department of Environmental Conservation; Larry Fink and Rich Osborn, New Jersey Green Acres Program; Lewis Lain, Town of Minisink, NY; Jim Doherty, Wantage Town Manager; Lori DuBord, Congressman Hinchey's Office; Emile DeVito, NJ Conservation Foundation; Rick Jones, Orange County Department of Planning; Rich Hehmeyer, Trust for Public Land; Donna Traylor, Sussex County Farmland Preservation and Conservation: Kira Dacanay, Americorps: Congressman Scott

Garrett; Dennis Miranda, Sierra Club — Northwest Group

Topics: Draft CCP/LPP, particularly the Service's proposed alternative including

the proposed refuge expansion; update on land protection priorities from our partners; discussion on how to work together to achieve common land protection

objectives.

**Briefing Elected Officials** and Others

**ected Officials** June 20, 2001 Representative Benjamin A. Gilman at Washington, DC.

June 20, 2001 Aides to Representative Maurice D. Hinchey at Washington, DC.

March 12, 2002 Aides to Representative Gilman at Washington, DC.March 12, 2002 Aides to Representative Hinchey at Washington, DC.

July 30, 2002 Representative Hinchey's Chief of Staff, Paul Brotherton, at the

refuge.

March 27, 2003 Steve Kahl, Kevin Holcomb and Beth Goldstein brief Ted

Kerpez, Regional Wildlife Manager, Bill Rudge, Natural

Resources Supervisor, and Leslie Zucker, Hudson River Estuary

Program, NYSDEC

May 17, 2004 Shawangunk Ridge Biodiversity Partnership

March 8, 2005 Congressman Scott Garrett and staff in Washington, D.C.

Congresswoman Sue Kelly in Washington, D.C.

#### **Release of Draft CCP**

In March 2008 we completed and released the draft CCP/EA for a 66-day public review and comment. In addition, we held a public meeting/open house on the following dates at the following locations:

February 20, 2008 Number of non-FWS attendees: 68 Location: Augusta, NJ

February 21, 2008 Number of non-FWS attendees: 97

Location: Wantage, NJ

March 6, 2008 Number of non-FWS attendees: 78

Location: Warwick, NY

We analyzed all of the comments on the draft CCP/EA we received during its 66-day public review, and applied them when we revised it into our final CCP. Appendix J summarizes those public comments and our responses to them.

Each year, we will evaluate our accomplishments on the refuge in accordance with the preferred action selected in the final CCP. We may intensify refuge monitoring without additional NEPA compliance; however, any results of our future monitoring that predict a new, significant impact would require our analysis and public involvement in an additional environmental analysis.